

**Exporting the Public Value Test: assessing  
EU Member States' evaluation of public  
broadcasters' new media services.**

**The United Kingdom.**

Richard Collins  
Professor of Media Studies  
The Open University.

[R.E.Collins@open.ac.uk](mailto:R.E.Collins@open.ac.uk)

# Public value and UK broadcasting.

- Public Value tests in UK media apply only to the BBC.
- Universal applicability of public value criteria to the BBC's output and activities different from
- the Public Value Test (PVT) administered by the BBC Trust to BBC Executive's proposals for **new** services.
- First, Trust administered, PVT 2007 - proposals for on-demand services.

# Why the PVT?

## Positive and negative factors.

- A general “New Labour” Government interest in fostering innovation in public sector management.
- A growing belief that the growth and profile of the BBC should be subject to more stringent external scrutiny (eg Graf Report 2004).
- The signals from the European Commission, eg in the Altmark Trans and in the Commission’s judgement in the Research Machines’ state aids case against the BBC’s digital curriculum initiatives, both 2003, that UK policies and procedures were not necessarily sufficient to ensure conformity to EU norms.

## **Mark Moore, public value theory and British administrative practice.**

Moore, M. (1995) *Creating Public Value. Strategic Management in Government.*

- Boo, to old public management – hierarchical, producer captured, insensitive to demand, ineffective.
- Boo, too, to new public management – private sector methods into the public sector.
- ‘hitting the target but missing the point’
- Rah, to co-production and contestation (competition).

# British translation of Moore.

- Gavin Kelly and Stephen Muers' (2002) for the Cabinet Office *Creating Public Value*.
- Partnership between users and providers, potentially combines downward accountability to users, but to users as citizens rather than as subjects or consumers.
- Local authorities, police, Royal Opera House, Health and Education Authorities etc (see <http://www.theworkfoundation.com/research/publicvalue/publicvaluereports.aspx> ).

# BBC Building Public Value (BPV) 2004.

- Securing Charter renewal: BPV “a manifesto..... but not everything in the manifesto will be delivered”.
- “the BBC exists to create public value.... it aims to serve its audiences not just as consumers, but as members of a wider society..... Public value is a measure of the BBC’s contribution to the quality of life in the UK” (BBC 2004: 7-8).
- Negative public value?
- Is public value in the BBC more than/different from the PVT? A “ritual of verification” (Power 1997)?

# State aid, the PVT and public value.

- European Commission's 2009 *Communication from the Commission on the application of State aid rules to public service broadcasting* requires : “definition of the public service mandate by the Member States should be as precise as possible. It should leave no doubt as to whether a certain activity performed by the entrusted operator is intended by the Member State to be included in the public service remit or not”.
- Top down not bottom up – different from “contestation and co-production”.
- Maria Michaelis – will describe the PVTs.

# Evaluating PV doctrine in the BBC.

- PVT has increased transparency and rigour.
- But massively bureaucratic – “old” public management.
- Irrelevant to many important decisions.
- And has the “ritualisation of verification” missed an opportunity?
- What does the BBC need? As well as rigour in resource management and planning it needs a vision – a sense that PSB is different.
- “Public Value” is a form of policing not an inspiration which, at his best, Mark Moore offered.
- The PVT - “hitting the target but missing the point”?